John Pinkerton and his vision of ancient Scythians: "Si les Aryens n'existaient pas, il faudrait les inventer" | Ivo Budil

14 | 15

*Ivo Budil*

## John Pinkerton and his vision of ancient Scythians: "Si les Aryens n´existaient pas, il faudrait les inventer"[1]

*1) Studie je dílčím výstupem projektu specifického výzkumu Katedry antropologických a historických věd FF ZČU, 2009.*

**Abstract**

*The main purpose of the article is to describe the racial interpretation of European history proposed by an eminent British scholar John Pinkerton (1758–1826) in his book A Dissertation on the Origin and Progress of the Scythians or Goths (1787). The hypothesis suggested by John Pinkerton will be evaluated in a broader historical, intellectual and cultural context and its relationship to traditional Scytho-Celtic paradigm and indology of Royal Asiatic Society will be analyzed. Author argued that we could derive some fundamental similarities between Pinkerton's thesis and Aryan ideology penetrating Western political culture in the second half of nineteenth century. The fact could indicate that Western mentality used to be in a certain sense preadapted at the threshold of modernity for expansion of a new "myth of foundation" in the guise of racial aggressive narrative.*

John Pinkerton (1758–1826) as scholar has been widely neglected in the debates concerning the emergence of modern racial thinking including the Aryan imagination.[2] In his excellent survey of the intellectual development of British collective identities prior

*2) For instance, the name of John Pinkerton is missing in the classic narrative on the roots of Western racial ideology written by Léon Poliakov (1996, first edition 1971).*

John Pinkerton and his vision of ancient Scythians: "Si les Aryens n'existaient pas, il faudrait les inventer" | Ivo Budil

16 | 17

1800, Colin Kidd emphasized Pinkerton's role in the rise of *"a racist ideology celebrating the common Teutonic origins of Britain's core English and Lowland Scots nations".*[3] Therefore, John Pinkerton exploited an alleged *"Gothic associations of the Picts as the foundation for a full-blown Scottish Teutonism"* and appreciated the Lowlanders of modern Scotland as *"a libertarian and industrious Teutonic people".*[4] Colin Kidd argued that Pinkerton as *"the late Enlightenment racialist"* brought together *"a critique of the Old Testament, a Voltairean anti-Judaism, polygenesis and a virulent Celtophobia".*[5] Reginald Horsman depicted John Pinkerton as a strong proponent of racial inferiority of Celts having foreshadowed the racial scientific essentialism of the nineteenth-century.[6]

The main purpose of this article is to analyze the Pinkerton's scientific endeavor in the broader historical and intellectual context. I will try to demonstrate that his speculation on the fundamental role of the Scythians at the dawn of the Western civilization involved the structure of arguments close to that used by the founding fathers of the Aryan ideology. Pinkerton's work indicated that the European academic milieu was pre-adapted to accept a new secular "myth of foundation" involving the image of expansion of Asiatic pastoral nomads as an alternative scenario to the traditional narrative of the Old Testament. However, because of the progress in comparative and historical philology achieved by scholars in British Calcutta, the Aryans gained sounder scientific backing than Scythians whose studies were linked to the older stage of the Western disciplines focused on the Orient. Subsequently, the Scythians were completely replaced by Aryans in the genealogical imagination of the nineteenth-century as the alleged ancestors of the modern European populations.

Western civilization could be labeled as logo-centric not because of special qualities of philosophical thinking only. Language has been playing an important role in many aspects of European imagination including religion, origins and characters of nations or historical narratives and consciousness. Linguistic inquiry had been considered to be a key for reconstruction of the roots of Western civilization. In the eighteenth-century the alliance between the concept of race and philology developed having made the "achievements" of linguistic creativity, performance and heritage of a concrete ethnic group an indicator of its "racial quality". The most destructive form of racial ideology presented by Aryan fantasy emerged initially from the linguistic speculations on the mutual affinities between European and Indian languages. At the beginning of the second half

of the nineteenth century the philology had been replaced by craniometry as a fundamental methodology for a definition of a race.

The sacred genealogies of Noah's descendants described in *Genesis* provided a clue for understanding world ethnic diversity and arguments for all speculations concerning ethnic and national origins from medieval and early modern ages almost to the dawn of modern anthropological and ethnological disciplines. As Colin Kidd emphasized, *"the death of Adam was a slow death",* even as the sciences on human diversity were "demythologized", they still kept "Mosaic" structure of arguments taken from the tradition of *Genesis*.[7] Christian scholars recognized the three sons of Noah – Shem, Ham, and Japheth – under the pagan names Cronos, Titan, and Japhets. Josephus stressed that the descendants of Shem populated *"Asia to the Indian Ocean",* while sons of Japheth occupied Europe from Tanaïs (Don) to Gadeïra (Cadiz). According to the *Book of Jubilee* from second century BC *"all that is to the north (of the Don) belongs to Japheth and all that is to the south belongs to Shem".*[8] Colin Kidd emphasized that the dominant Western linguistic school before the arrival of Indo-European philology was so-called Scytho-Celtic paradigm.[9] It presented an attempt to accommodate the biblical tradition to classical ethnological sources and local ethnic memories,[10] to retain Hebrew as a language inspired by God and to appreciate the role of local European languages in the same time.[11] For instance, Adriaen van Scrieck considered Hebrew to be the *primogenia ("first-born")* while *lingua Iaphetica ("neighbor language")* presented *"mother tongue of Scythian, Celtic, Teutonic, Belgian, Danish, and northern".*[12] The idea of timeless sacrality of Hebrew had influenced strongly the development of Western historical, philological and ethnological disciplines.[13] In 1765 Nicolas Beauzée remarked in the article entitled *"langue"* in the Encyclopédie that *"the modern languages of Europe, which adopted analytic construction,*

---

3) KIDD, 1999, p. 204.

4) Ibidem, p. 204.

5) Ibidem, p. 56.

6) HORSMAN, 1976, p. 391.

7) KIDD, 1999, p. 10.

8) OLENDER, 1994, p. 11.

9) KIDD, 1999, p. 31. The locus classicus is one sentence in William Camden's Britain (1610, 2.66): "… in times past, as Strabo writeth, al people Westward were termed Celto-Scythae" (cit. SHUGER, 1997, p. 499).

10) For instance, Tacitus in Germania mentions the tradition that Ulysses should have visited the west of Germany, and built Asciburg on the Rhine; and "a Northern antiquary has hence dreamed that Ulysses was Odin" (PINKERTON, 1787, p. 46).

11) OLENDER, 1994, p. 16.

12) Ibidem, p. 16.

13) Ibidem, p. 19.

John Pinkerton and his vision of ancient Scythians: "Si les Aryens n'existaient pas, il faudrait les inventer" | Ivo Budil

18 | 19

*remain much closer to the primitive language than did Greek or Latin... Thus our modern language (French) as well as Spanish and English, are linked to Hebrew through Celtic".*[14]

The political development in Europe in the sixteenth and seventeenth century enabled the rise of the new genealogical speculations on the national origins following the Noachic or Graeco-Troja lineages and reflecting political aspirations of emerging political units and powers. The sacred hegemony of Hebrew as a primordial language of the Paradise was challenged and that fact had vast consequences for development of collective identities of Western nations.

A traditional view reflecting the religious prestige of Hebrew, for instance the thesis of Samuel Bochart on the mutual genealogical connections between Hebrew and the languages of Europe via the Phoenicians or demonstration presented by Father Louis Thomassin in 1690 on the proximity between Hebrew and French, was marginalized by the aspirations of local ethnical idioms and "patriotic humanists".[15] Maurice Olender stressed that *"each region of Europe thus had its doctors 'of Languages of Paradise',or specialists in the study of their Babelian derivatives".*[16] Gimbattista Vico ineffectually criticized in his New Science these new fantastical narratives as a preposterous vainglory.[17] For instance, Goropius Becanus (1518–1572) identified the Flemish dialect spoken in Antwerp (financial centre of Europe till Spanish occupation in 1585) as the original Adamic language.[18] Seventeenth-century Swedish expansionism was buttressed by the idea of Olaus Rudbeck (1630–1702) proposed in his book *Atlantica sive Manheim* (1679–1702) that the Sweden was the lost Atlantis and that Scandinavia presented *"the womb of nations".*[19] In 1756 wrote Turgot in his article on "étymologie" in the *Encyclopédie: "One sees all the patriarchs of the Old Testament and their history, another sees only Swedish or Celtic heroes."*[20]

The humanistic reading of Tacitus and the Reformation contributed to the new interest in archaic Germans, their language and qualities of a pure race *"untainted by intermarriage with other races".*[21] However, the concept of German superiority and linguistic and cultural exclusiveness is older. In thirteenth century Rodericus Toleta-

14) *OLENDER, 1994, p. 18–19.*

15) *La Méthode d'étudier et d'enseigner chrestiennement et utilement la Grammaire, ou les Langues par rapport à l'Ecriture sainte en les réduisant toutes à l'Hebreu (1690); KIDD, 1999, p. 31; OLENDER, 1994, p. 18.*

16) *OLENDER, 1994, p. 13.*

17) *KIDD, 1999, p. 29.*

18) *KIDD, 1999, p. 31; POLIAKOV, 1996, p. 90; OLENDER, 1994, p. 13.*

19) *KIDD, 1999, pp. 29–30.*

20) *Cit. KIDD, 1999, p. 14.*

21) *HORSMAN, 1976, p. 389.*

nus (1170–1247), Archbishop of Toledo (1208–1247) and author of *De rebus Hispaniae* and *Historia Arabum,*[22] wrote that *"Germany, Denmark, Norway, Sweden, Flanders, and England, have all one speech, though distinguished by their idioms".*[23] Walafrid Strabo (808–849), a Benedictine monk, poet and theologian, who was preceptor of the young Prince Charles the Bald at the court of Louis the Pious before having been elected the abbot of Reichenau, remarked that *"the Goths, who were also called Getae, being in the provinces of the Greek empire at the time they were brought to the Christian faith, though not by the right way, had our language, that is the Tudesque".*[24]

The notion of common linguistic and cultural identity had been accompanied by the animosity to the classical civilization of the South inhabited by Latin nations called *Welsche.*[25] Probably the most famous expression of the ethnical and cultural hatred reflecting an old bipolarity between barbarism and civilization in early Middle Ages provided Liutprand (922–972), Bishop of Cremona, in his *Relatio de Legatione Constantinopolitana ad Nicephorum Phocam.* This ambitious politician and historian belonged to a distinguished Lombard family. He became a confidential secretary of Berenger II, ruler of Italy, at his court in Pavia. In 949 Liutprand was sent on an embassy to Constantinople. Later, he fell into disgrace in Pavia and attached himself to the court of Emperor Otto I who made him bishop of Cremona in 962. Six years later Liutprand came to Constantinople again by order of Otto I to ask the Byzantine Emperor Nicephorus Phocas to bestow his daughter Theophano in marriage on Otto's son, later Otto II, and to negotiate on some territorial disputes – Eastern Emperor claimed Benevento and Capua, which were in Lombard hands. In *Relatio de Legatione Constantinopolitana ad Nicephorum Phocam* Bishop of Cremona described his humiliation from the side of Byzantine ruler and his own proud response challenging Roman supremacy:

*"On this same day he ordered me to be his guest. Not; thinking me worthy, however, to be placed above any of his nobles, I sat in the fifteenth place from him, and without a tablecloth. Not only did no one of my suite sit at table, but not one of them saw even the house in which I was a guest. During which disgusting and foul meal, which was washed down with oil after the manner of drunkards, and moistened also with a certain and other exceedingly bad fish liquor, he asked me many questions concerning your power, many concerning*

22) *Marcus Toledanus, canon at the Toledo cathedral, translated the Qur'an into latin (1209–1210) at his request.*

23) *"Teutonia, Dacia, Norvegia, Suecia, Flandria, et Anglia, unicam habent linguam, licet idiomatibus dignoscantur" (cit. PINKERTON, 1787, p. 112).*

24) *"Gothi, qui et Getae, eo tempore quo ad fidem Christi, licet non recto itinere, perducti sunt, in Graecorum provincii commerarent, nostrum, id est Theotiscum sermonem habuerunt" (cit. PINKERTON, 1787, str. 112).*

25) *POLIAKOV, 1996, p. 72.*

*your dominions and your army. And when I had replied to him consequently and truly, 'You
lie,' he said, 'the soldiers of your master do-not know how to ride, nor do they know how to
fight on foot; the size of their shields, the weight of their breast-plates, the length of their
swords, and the burden of their helms permits them to fight in neither one way nor the other.'
Then he added, smiling: 'their gluttony also impedes them, for their God is their belly, their
courage but wind, their bravery drunkenness. Their fasting means dissolution, their sobri-
ety panic. Nor has your master a number of fleets on the sea. I alone have a force of navi-
gators; I will attack him with my ships, I will overrun his maritime cities with war, and those
which are near the rivers I will reduce to ashes. And how, I ask, can he even on land resist we
with his scanty forces? His son was there, his wife was there, the Saxons, Swabians, Bavar-
ians, were all with him: and if they did not know enough and were unable to take one little
city that resisted them, how will they resist me when I come, I who am followed by as many
troops as Gargara corn-ears have, or grape-shoots the island of Lesbos, Stars in the sky are
found, or waves in the billowy ocean.*

*When I wished to reply to him and to give forth an answer worthy of his boast-
ing, he did not permit me; but added as if to scoff at me: 'You are not Romans but Lom-
bards.' When he wished to speak further and was waving his hand to impose silence upon
me, I said in anger: 'History, teaches that the fratricide Romulus, from whom also the Ro-
mans are named, was born in adultery; and that he made an asylum for himself in which he
received insolvent debtors, fugitive slaves, homicides, and those who were worthy of death
for their deeds. And he called to himself a certain number of such and called them Romans.
From such nobility those are descended whom you call world-rulers, that is, emperors; whom
we, namely the Lombards, Saxons, Franks, Lotharingians, Bavarians, Swabians, Burgun-
dians, so despise, that when angry, we can call our enemies nothing more scornful than Ro-
man-comprehending in this one thing, that is in the name of the Romans, whatever there
is of contemptibility, of timidity, of avarice, of luxury, of lying: in a word, of viciousness. But
because you do maintain that we are unwarlike and ignorant of horsemanship, if the sins
of the Christians shall merit that you shall remain in this hard-heartedness: the next battle
will show what you are, and how warlike we.'*"[26]

German ethnocentrism penetrated the mediaeval religious imagination and con-
tested the universalism of Christian orthodoxy. Blessed Hildegard of Bingen (1098–1179),
German Benedictine abbess, mystic, visionary and scholar, sometimes called "Sybil of the
Rhine", was convinced that Adam and Eve spoke German, because *"Adam and Eva Teutonica
lingua loquebantur, quae, in diversa non dividitur ut Romana".*[27] Norman Cohn and Léon Po-
liakov called attention to an obscure phenomenon of *The Book of a Hundred Chapters* writ-
ten in Alsace between 1490 and 1510 by an anonymous *"The Revolutionary of the Upper*

26) http://www.fordham.edu/halsall/source/liudprand1.html, 447–448, 2. 1. 2009
27) Cit. POLIAKOV, 1996, p. 76.

*Rhine"* and involving a mixture of millennial fantasy with genocidal ethnocentrism and pan-
German eschatology: *"We Germans are free, we are all noble; we have ruled and taken pos-
session of the whole earth by force and before long, with God's help, we shall bring the world
into submission to the ancient order."*[28] Therefore, we could see that there was a long conti-
nuity of German ethnocentrism from the early middle ages into early modern age having
assimilated in each concrete period a prevalent idiom for its articulation.[29]

The system of ethnic classification suggested by Philip Cluverius (1580–1622)
in his highly influential treatise *Germania Antiqua* (1616) was maintained and shared by Eu-
ropean scholars into the eighteenth century.[30] Cluverius was convinced that *"the ancient
and original inhabitants of Europe… consisted only of two distinct races of men,…, the Celts
and Sarmatians; and that from one or other of these, but chiefly from the former, all the an-
cient nations of Europe are descended. The Sarmatians or Sauromachae were the ancestors
of the Sclavonian tribes,…, the Poles, Russians, Bohemians, etc., who continue to this day a
distinct and separate people, extremely different in their character, manners, laws and lan-
guage, from the other race, which was that of the Celts, from whom… were uniformly de-
scended the old inhabitants of Gaul, Germany, Scandinavia, Britain and Spain, who were all
included by the ancients under the general name of Hyperboreans, Scythians, and Celts, be-
ing all originally of one race and nations, and having all the same common language, reli-
gion, laws, customs and manners".*[31] German scholar Johannes Wachter (1663–1757) dis-
tinguished three distinct groups of Scythians among the peoples of Europe – the northern
Scythians proper, the western Celtae and the Germanic Celto-Scythians – and character-
ized the Celtic tongue as *"the final stage of a united Germanic language before the evolu-
tion of its various dialects".*[32]

Therefore, Scythians, Germans and Celts presented the basic building blocks to
explain the origins and development of European ethnic diversity in Western early modern

28) Cit. POLIAKOV, 1996, p. 78; BUDIL, 2002, pp. 42–47.
29) The supposed purity of a primordial Anglo-Saxon Church was stressed by Archbishop
Matthew Parker and some other scholars to serve as justification for the break with Rome.
In the late sixteenth and early seventeenth century the interest switched from the reli-
gious questions to the nature of political and legal institutions of ancient Anglo-Saxons
who were pictured as "a freedom-loving people, enjoying representative institutions and
a flourishing primitive democracy" (HORSMAN, 1976, p. 388). The Anglo-Saxonism in
its highly developed racial form served as an ideology of the legitimization of the world-
wide hegemony and superiority of the British empire and the United States in last dec-
ades of the nineteenth century and in the first half of the twentieth century.
30) KIDD, 1999, p. 191.
31) Bishop Percy's Preface in MALLET, 1847, pp. 2–3.
32) KIDD, 1999, p. 189.

John Pinkerton and his vision of ancient Scythians: "Si les Aryens n'existaient pas, il faudrait
les inventer" | Ivo Budil

22 | 23

age scholarship. All these terms were used in a very vague manner enabling a rise of fantastical speculations expressing implicit ideological or political interest.

James William Johnson in his brief, but comprehensive survey of the history of "Scythian myth" pointed out that "*the allusively fertile name of the Scythians was repeatedly called upon by writers from Homer to Rousseau"*, however, "*the motive and the intended connotation were by no means standardized. Only the totemic nature of the Scythians remained unchanged".*[33] Johnson stressed that "*the casting of the Scythians in the role of the Noble Savage was a phenomenon which began in the fourth century BC and lasted well until the end of the eighteenth century AD".*[34] The historical Scythians were not mythological or imaginary beings but concrete Indo-European populations having moved from Central Asia along with nomadic Sarmatians into Northern Turkestan and the Caspian region.[35] By 700 BC they seemed to control the territory from Eastern Central Europe in the west to Afghanistan in the east.[36] In Asia Minor the Scythians came into contact with the Greeks.[37] The Scythians as effective horsemen might have been the first people to ride on horseback or to wear trousers.[38] In the first or second century BC the Scythians were assimilated by the "cousins" Sarmatians; but the Greeks continued to call the new hybrid nomadic population "Scythians" or "Getae", "*the latter being the usual appellation after the third century AD".*[39]

Ephorus (400–330 BC) appreciated the Scythians as "*being simple, just, generous, frugal, and highly virtuous".*[40] For Aeschylus the Scythians were "*most righteous"*, "*well ordered"*, "*hospitable people"*, "*morally superior to the wealthy, politically advanced Greeks".*[41] Strabo wrote in a similar vein: "*… for we regard the Scythians the most straightforward of men and the least prone to mischief, as also far more frugal and independent of others than we are. And yet our mode of life has spread its changes for the worse to almost all peoples."*[42]

Despite its ideological attachment to the "pagan" stoicism the "the Scythian myth" was assimilated by "a divinely Hebrew history" in the context of Christian civilization.[43]

33) JOHNSON, 1959, p. 251.
34) Ibidem, p. 252.
35) Ibidem, p. 250.
36) Ibidem, p. 250.
37) Ibidem, p. 250.
38) Ibidem, p. 250.
39) Ibidem, p. 250.
40) Ibidem, p. 252.
41) Ibidem, p. 252.
42) Ibidem, p. 252.
43) Ibidem, p. 253–254.

For instance Pompeius Trogus and Justin admitted the idea of the universal flood and they supposed that the mountainous region of Scythia should have emerged first from the receding waters. Therefore, the Roman historians argued that the Scythians must have been the most ancient people in the world.[44]

As Old Testament provided legendary Noah with three sons to occupy the earth, Jewish scholar Josephus made in his *Histories* Scythians, whose devastating raids on the Near East and Palestine in the seventh century BC inflamed a Hebraic antipathy inherited by some Church fathers,[45] the sons of Magog who was himself the second son of Japhet.[46] Isidore of Seville was convinced that Scythians and Goths as "primordial nation" derived their origin from Magog also.[47] The view of the common ancestry to the Scythians and Goths was shared by other scholars of early medieval period. Procopius wrote that both Goths and Huns came from the region traditionally called Scythia.[48] Jordanes whose accounts were based on an earlier historical survey of Cassiodorus traced the origin of Goths back to Scandinavia, from which they migrated to Scythia.[49] The Venerable Bede derived the "Redshanks" among the early Britons from Scythia.[50] The genealogical identification of Goths and Scythians presented a crucial intellectual event in the construction of the collective identity of Western civilization. James William Johnson emphasized that "*from this time onward, the Scythian enjoyed a new glory as the parent of virtually every nation in western Europe… By degrees, the Scythians became sires to the Franks, Celts, Hungarians, Bulgarians, Swedes, and numerous other races. In this fashion, the Scythian survived the demolition of this legendary virtue, and with a largely revised role became as integral a part of Renaissance history as he had Graeco-Roman".*[51]

Historian Polydore Vergil (1470–1555), born at Ubino and student of universities at Bologna and Padua, was sent by Pope Alexander VI to England as a sub-collector of Peterspence. King Henry VII commissioned him in 1505 to write the history of England

44) JOHNSON, 1959, p. 255.
45) Josephus wrote that "*the Scythians delight in murdering people and are little better than wild beasts" (JOHNSON, 1959, p. 254); Tertullian was convinced that Scythians were "rude, barbarous, promiscuous, and cannibalistic" (Ibid, p. 254); Jerome declared that "they devour their slaughtered parents, kinsmen, neighbors when they reach old age" (Ibid, p. 254); Isidore of Seville argued that "these monstrous butchers live on human flesh and blood" (Ibid, p. 254).*
46) JOHNSON, 1959, p. 255.
47) OLENDER, 1994, p. 12; JOHNSON, 1959, p. 255.
48) Ibidem, p. 256.
49) Ibidem, p. 256.
50) Ibidem, p. 256.
51) Ibidem, p. 256–257.

John Pinkerton and his vision of ancient Scythians: "Si les Aryens n'existaient pas, il faudrait les inventer" | Ivo Budil

24 | 25

(*Historia Anglica*, 1533). Polydore Vergil used the theory on the Scythian origin of European nations to explain kinship between the Germanic and Celtic peoples.[52] The Scythian hypothesis having dominated in the sixteenth and seventeenth century the Western academic circles was explicitly formulated for instance by Georgius Hornius in 1654.[53] Sir Walter Raleigh made the Scythians, Sarmatians, and Cimmerians all one race, "*who peopled most of the Western World, and whose reflex overwhelmed no small part of Greece and Asia*".[54] Hugo Grotius considered in his *Historia Gotthorum* (1655) Germans to have been derived from the Scythians.[55] Despite the "*folie de grandeur*"[56] of some scholars focused on eulogy of their alleged ethnic ancestors, the mainstream of seventeenth-century Western authors shared the Scytho-Celtic paradigm. William Camden, John Speed or Raphael Holinshed traced the origin of Britons back to the Scythians and related them to Celts and Goths.[57] Justus Georg Schottel (1612–1672) included all Celtic languages and Gothic dialects into one common linguistic family.[58] Simon Pelloutier (1694–1757), Protestant minister, counselor of the Consistory and librarian of the Academy at Berlin, who descended from a Hugenot family originally of Languedoc, stressed in his work *Histoire des Celtes, et particulièrement des Gaulois et des Germains* (1750) that German dialects presented "*un reste de l'ancienne langue des Celtes*".[59]

German philosopher and scholar Wilhelm Leibniz rejected the primordial status of Hebrew and accepted the idea that Latin and Greek shared many similarities with the Germanic and Celtic languages. It could reflect an existence of *lingua japhetica*, ancient ancestor of European languages. Leibniz stressed the common origins of all "*these peoples*" (inhabitants of Europe) descended from the Scythians: "*For, all these languages of Scythia share many common roots with one another and with our (languages).*"[60] Wilhelm Leibniz appreciated the role of Nordic nations as well and in 1697 he equated "*the origin of the peoples and the languages of Europe*" with "*the archaic German language*".[61]

In the second half of the eighteenth-century two important mutually independent events occurred with crucial impacts on the Western philological imagination and having paved way for expansion of the new linguistic paradigm: The schism between Germanic and Celtic languages, culture and ethnicity and marginalization of the Scythians as hypothetical ancestors of European nations. The historical role of "Nordic nations" that (in words of Paul-Henri Mallet) "*changed the face of Europe*" and initiated "*great revolutions*" was finally fully appreciated and acknowledged.[62]

The affinity between Celts and Germans was challenged by Thomas Percy (1729–1811), Bishop of Dromore, in his famous *Preface* to critical English edition of *Northern antiquities* (1770) by Paul-Henri Mallet.[63] Thomas Percy made a clear distinction between Celts and Germans and criticized Mallet whom he thought "*had been drawn in to adopt an opinion that has been a great source of mistake and confusion to many learned writers of the ancient history of Europe; viz., that of supposing the ancient Gauls and Germans, the Britons and Saxons to have been all originally one and the same people; thus confounding the antiquities of the Gothic and Celtic nations. This crude opinion, which perhaps was first taken up by Cluverius, and maintained by him with uncommon erudition, has been since incautiously adopted by Keysler and Pelloutier, the latter of whom has, with great diligence and skill, endeavoured to confirm it. In short, so much learning and ingenuity have scarcely ever been more perversely and erroneously applied, or brought to adorn and support a more groundless hypothesis. This mistake the translator thought might be easily corrected in the present work; and by weeding out this one error, he hoped he should obtain the author's*

52) Polydore Vergil wrote that the Picts "weare a people of Scithia, and verie neare tot he Gothes in contrie and manners, soe weare they a crewell nation and marvelus prone to fight" (cit. JOHNSON, 1959, p. 256).

53) Georgius Hornius wrote in 1654 in the preface of the posthumous publication of Boxhorn's Originum Gallicarum: "Vidit (he means Boxhorn) innumera vocabula, Germanis, Latinis, Graecis et aliis per Europam nationibus, communia esse. Inde conjiciebat a communi fonte eam similitudinem profectam, id est eadem omnium illarum gentium origene … Quara alia via rem aggressus, communem quandam linguam, Guam scythicam vombat, matrem graecae, latinae, germanicae et persicae statuit, ex qua ilee velut dialecti, prosiciscantur" (cit. OLENDER, 1994, p. 21).

54) JOHNSON, 1959, p. 256.

55) RUBIÉS, 1991, p. 231.

56) POLIAKOV, 1996.

57) JOHNSON, 1959, p. 256.

58) KIDD, 1999, p. 192.

59) Bishop Percy's Preface in MALLET, 1847, p. 2; KIDD, 1999, p. 193.

60) Cit. OLENDER, 1994, p. 19.

61) Unvorgreifliche Gedanken, betreffend die Ausübung und Verbesserung der teutschen Sprache (1698): „Stecket also im Teutschen Alterthum und sonderlich in der Teutschen uralten Sprache, so über das Alter aller Griechischen und Lateinischen Bücher hinauf steiget, der Ursprung der Europäischen Völker und Sprachen, auch zum Theil des uralten Gottesdienstes, der Sitten, Rechte des Adels"; cit. OLENDER, 1994, p. 20.

62) "Tous les Peuples du Nord peuvent revendiquer la même gloire, si le mot gloire est fait pour de pareilles expéditions" (MALLET, 1758, p. 2).

63) "It is very certain that in latter times, such of them (Greek and Roman writers) as had most discernment, and the best opportunities of being informed, have plainly and clearly delivered that the Germans and Gauls were two distinct people, of different origin, manners, laws, religion and language, and have accurately pointed out the difference between them" (Bishop Percy's Preface in MALLET, 1847, p. 7).

John Pinkerton and his vision of ancient Scythians: "Si les Aryens n'existaient pas, il faudrait
les inventer" | Ivo Budil

26 | 27

*pardon, and acquire some merit with the English reader".*[64] Thomas Percy emphasized
that the position of above mentioned authors, *"so far as relates to the Celts, is erroneous
and the arguments that support it inconclusive, will appear, if it can be shown, that ancient
Germany, Scandinavia, Gaul and Britain, were not inhabited by the descendants of one sin-
gle race; but on the contrary, divided between two very different people; the one of whom
we shall call, with most of the Roman authors, Celtic, who were the ancestors of the Gauls,
Britons, and Irish; the other Gothic or Teutonic, from whom the Germans, Belgians, Saxons
and Scandinavians, derived their origin; and that these were ab origine two distinct people,
very unlike in their manners, customs, religion, and laws."*[65] These arguments made Tho-
mas Percy one of the founders of romantic fascination of German prehistory and belief
in a special historical vocation of Germanic people. Percy supposed that *"the Sacae and
Messagetae might possibly be the ancestors of the Saxons and the Goths"* who had moved
westward in ancient times as testified by the fact *"that the Germanii are mentioned by
Herodotus as a Persian people".*[66] The eastern origin of the German nation seemed to
have been thus proved.[67] Thomas Percy acknowledged an extremely savage nature of
ancient Germans and Celts,[68] but a crucial difference between both races was for him the
concept of personal and political freedom: *"The Celtic nations do not appear to have had
that equal plan of liberty, which was the peculiar honour of all the Gothic tribes, and which
they carried with them, and planted wherever they formed settlements. On the contrary, in
Gaul, all the freedom and power chiefly centered among the Druids and the chief men, whom*

64) *Bishop Percy's* Preface *in MALLET, 1847, p. 2.*

65) *Bishop Percy's* Preface *in MALLET, 1847, p. 3.*

66) *Bishop Percy's* Preface *in MALLET, 1847, p. 6.; Hérodotos, I, 125, 2003, p. 69.; PINK-
ERTON, 1787, p. 124. John Pinkerton remarked that there was also a Greek tribe called
Teutani, in Peloponnesus (PLINIUS, III, 8, PINKERTON, 1787, p. 124).*

67) *"Now the most authentic historians and poets of the Teutonic nations all agree that
their ancestors came at different emigrations from the more eastern countries" (Bishop
Percy's Preface in MALLET, 1847, p. 6).*

68) *"The more men approach to a state of wild and uncivilized life, the greater resem-
blance they will have in manners, because savage nature, reduced almost to mere brutal
instinct, is simple and uniform; whereas art and refinement are infinitely various: thus
one of the rude natives of Nova Zembla will hear a strong resemblance in his manners of
life to a savage of New Holland... The ancient Britons in the time of Caesar painted their
bodies, as do the present Cherokees of North America" (Bishop Percy's Preface in MAL-
LET, 1847, p. 7–8).*

*Caesar calls Equites, or knights; but the inferior people were little better than in a state of
slavery; whereas every the meanest German was independent and free."*[69]

Rasmus Rask highly appreciated Thomas Percy's text as a turning point in
the history of modern Western linguistics. In his *Introduction to the Icelandic Grammar*
(1811) Rask remarked, that *"after Bishop Percy's most excellent Preface to Mallet's North-
ern Antiquities, the Teutonic and Celtic languages can no longer be confounded, nor com-
prised under the vague and unmeaning appellation of Scythian, Sarmatian".*[70] The separa-
tion of Germanic elements from Scytho-Celtic context was accompanied by decline of
the "Scythian myth": *"The Scythian was ousted from his archetypal nobility by the latter
half of the 1700's, however; his appearances side by side with the American Indian in Rous-
seau's Discours sur les sciences et les arts was the final promenade of a moribund monarch
beside his heir."*[71] The process of emancipation of Western human sciences from Mosaic
tradition was accomplished. However, the "demythologization" of studies on human di-
versity was achieved at the cost of expansion of a new powerful modern "mythology"
in the guise of nationalism and racism. John Pinkerton personified and symbolized this
huge temptation of secular Western science.

John Pinkerton was born in Edinburgh where he finished his studies of law at
the local university. However, he paid more attention to the history, literature and lan-
guages of ancient Nordic nations. In 1776 Pinkerton published collection of poems *Elegy
on Craigmillar Castle* and in 1781 he settled down in London where he wrote his own po-
etry including *Scottish tragic ballads* (1781), *Two dithyrambic odes on enthusiasm and laugh-
ter* (1782) a *Select Scottish ballads* (1783). He exploited fully the romantic atmosphere
of "Nordic renaissance" created by works of James Macpherson, Paul-Henri Mallet and
Thomas Percy.[72] His energetic nature, extensive knowledge and almost complete lack of
modesty made him many opponents, for instance Joseph Ritson (1752–1803) or Walter
Scott.[73] Modern historian Hugh Trevor-Roper called him "eccentric". However, the wide
erudition demonstrated in studies *Essay on Medals* (1784) and *Letters of Literature* (1785)
gained Pinkerton a friendship of Horace Walpole and Edward Gibbon, but despite a sup-
port of Joseph Banks he was not able to get post in the British Museum he applied for.

In 1787 John Pinkerton published *A Dissertation on the Origin and Progress of
the Scythians or Goths*, a highly neglected evidence of development of early racial think-
ing in Western human sciences. In his *Preface* Pinkerton expressed his deep admiration

69) *Bishop Percy's Preface in MALLET, 1847, p. 10.*

70) *I.A. Blackwell's Remark on Bishop Percy's Preface in MALLET, 1847, p. 22.*

71) *JOHNSON, 1959, p. 257.*

72) *CRAIGIE, 1927.*

73) *Walter Scott called Pinkerton "the pugnacious Pinkerton" (SMITH, 1951, p. 175).*

John Pinkerton and his vision of ancient Scythians: "Si les Aryens n'existaient pas, il faudrait les inventer" | Ivo Budil

28 | 29

of ancient Goths whom he identified with Scythians[74] and preferred to Romans: "*Now, though almost all Europe be possessed by the descendents of the Goths, a people from whom, as shall be shown, the Greeks and Romans also sprung; and the Goths transcended, even when barbarians, all nations in wisdom and war: yet such is our ignorance, who are at present but slowly eloping from barbarism, that the name of Goth, the sacred name of our fathers,[75] is an object of detestation!... It springs solely from our love for Rome, (itself a Gothic state) which we draw from Roman writers at school; and our knowledge that the other Goths destroyed the Roman empire. Instead of turning our admiration to that great people, who could annihilate so potent an empire; instead of blessing the period that delivered all kingdoms from the dominion of one; we execrate our progenitors, to whom we are indebted for all our present happiness! We look on the Goths as enemies of science, without once reflecting that wisdom is at any time superior to science; and that the Goths only despised the science prevalent on the decline of Rome, which was folly, and is regarded as such by us at present.*"[76] For Pinkerton, the history of conquest of West by Scythians (or Goths) constituted "*a subject upon which the whole modern history of Europe depends*".[77]

Pinkerton was convinced that Phillip Cluverius who asserted that the Gothi were the Gutones, or Gothones, of Pomerellia, and Hugo Grotius who argued that the Goths went from Gothland in Sweden were biased because of their personal reasons.

Cluverius was a native of Pomerellia (Dantzick) and "*wanted all the glory of the Goths to his own dear Gothones*".[78] Hugo Grotius who was an ambassador of the queen of Sweden to France wanted to do all in his power for the glory of that kingdom.[79] Therefore, Pinkerton concluded without slightest hesitation that "*the dreams of Cluverius and Grotius... only merit laughter*".[80] His assertion that Simon Pelloutier identified Scythians with Celts,[81] because he was French, and therefore he wanted "*to make France the parent of all nations*",[82] and that "*his design is to show Gaul the parent country of modern nations in Europe, and thus to support the French dream of universal monarchy*"[83] was less convincing because Pelloutier having had his Hugenot family roots in Languedoc only was a Protestant living in Berlin under protection of a Prussian king. John Pinkerton appraised Thomas Percy, "*the most learned and ingenious translator of Mallet into English, who has altered his author so far as infected with this gross error, and has in an able preface shown that it is impossible that the Germans could be Celts*".[84] Pinkerton was very critical to contemporary academic world "*inundated with nonsense about the Celts*": "*This may be called the Celtic century.*" Fortunately, Pinkerton was certain that "*when we come to the truth about them, and time always draws truth out of the well, the Celtic mist will vanish, or become a mere cloud*".[85]

John Pinkerton who was skeptical to the traditional etymological method[86] did not hesitate to use the arguments taken from emerging racial thinking to underline

74) "*It is proper first to show that Scythae, Getae, Gothi, were but different names for one and the same people*" (PINKERTON, 1787, p. 5); "*As Mr. Gibbon well observes, all the Greek writers after this period still uniformly call those Scythae, whom the Latin authors denominate Gothi*" (PINKERTON, 1787, p. 6); "*If we cannot show the Germans to have been originally Scythae, this dissertation is inept*" (PINKERTON, 1787, p. 90). Pinkerton mentioned that Busbequius had remarked that some inhabitants of Crim Tatary (relics of old Scythae) spoke a language close to German (PINKERTON, 1787, p. 113). Hugo Grotius wrote on the Goths living in the region in the seventeenth century: "*Et quid mireris funt nunc quoque ad eandern Marotám iidem Gotthi; et, ut mores linguamque, fic et nomen per tot faecula retinent. Quanquam enim Busbequius, qui in illis locis non fuit, dubitat Gotthi fint an Saxones, certos nos fecit is qui in illis vixit regionibus, Josaphat Barbarus, nobilis Venetus; et Gotthos ipsos a semet dici, et terram vocari Gotthiam. Is Capitancatus Gotthiae dicitur in publicis monumentis tabularii Genuensis teste Petro Baptisto Burgo*" (cit. PINKERTON, 1787, p. 42). Oriens Christianus gave the title of local bishop in 1721, Metropolita Gothiae et Caphae (PINKERTON, 1787, p. 42).
75) The Count du Buat expressed this in his sentence "*Les anciens peoples de l´Europe que nous appellons barbares et qui sont nos peres*" (Histoire ancienne des peuples de l´Europe, Paris, 1772; cit. PINKERTON, 1787, p. vii).
76) PINKERTON, 1787, pp. vii-viii.
77) PINKERTON, 1787, p. 89.

78) PINKERTON, 1787, p. 9.
79) Ibidem, p. 9.
80) Ibidem, p. 13.
81) "*Les Celtes ont été connus anciennement sous le nom general des Scythes. C'est celui que les Grecs donnoient a tous les peuples qui habitoient le long du Danube, et au dela de ce fleuve, jusques dans le fond du Nord*" (cit. PINKERTON, 1787, p. 105). Pinkerton asserted that the sentence "*is an utter falsehold and absurdity*" (PINKERTON, 1787, p. 105).
82) PINKERTON, 1787, p. 18.
83) Ibidem, p. 106.
84) Ibidem, p. 100.
85) Ibidem, p. 123.
86) "*Indeed we cannot be too cautious against being misled by etymology, or by similar or identical words; for in early and traditional history they form the very rocks and sands upon which many an antiquarian ship has foundered. And the danger is so great that it is best never even to approach them*" (PINKERTON, 1787, p. 72). On the other hand, language presented for John Pinkerton the crucial clue for reconstruction of national history: "*Now of all marks of the origin of nations, that of language is the most infallible*" (PINKERTON, 1787, p. 76); Language "*is the chief mark of distinct nations; and the most certain and unalterable*" (PINKERTON, 1787, p. 103). Pinkerton was convinced that literary

John Pinkerton and his vision of ancient Scythians: "Si les Aryens n'existaient pas, il faudrait les inventer" | Ivo Budil

30 | 31

for instance difference between the Scythians and Huns.[87] He outlined one of the first racial maps of Europe inhabited by "*four grand races of men*" including: 1) "*The Celts, the most ancient inhabitants that can be traced; and who were to the other races what the savages of America are to the European settlers there.*" 2) "*The Iberi of Spain and Aquitania, who were Mauri and had past from Africa. These two races were few in number; the Celts being mostly destroyed by the Sarmatae and Scythae; and few of the Iberi having come into Europe.*" 3) "*The Sarmatae, who were in all appearance originally possessors of south-west Tartary, but expelled by the Tartars. For their speech, the Sarmatic or Slavonic is remote from the Tartaric; and their persons, full of grace and majesty, are different from those of Tartars: so that they are not of Tartaric origin.*" 4) "*The Scythians, who originated, as shall presently be seen, from present Persia; and spread from thence to the Euxine, and almost over all Europe.*"[88] In modern Europe these four basic racial groups could be still distinguished in four fundamental language families: "*The Celtic is spoken by the Irish and Welch. The Iberian still partly survives in the Galcunian or Basque, and Mauritanic. The Sarmatic is the vast Slavonic tongue. The Scythic comprehends the other nations; but especially the Germans and Scandinavians, whose speech is the least mixt.*"[89]

*A Dissertation on the Origin and Progress of the Scythians or Goths* presented a revolt against the traditional environmentalism in Western science on human and one of the first expressions of racial essentialism. John Pinkerton emphasized that the differences between races "*are radical; and such as no climate or chance could produce*"[90] and added: "*A Tartar, a Negro, an American, etc. differ as much from a German, as a bull-dog, or lap-dog, or shepherd's cur, from a pointer.*"[91] Contemporary geneticist and anthropologist Vincent Sarich and writer Frank Miele used in their book *Race: The Reality of Human Differences* (2004) almost exactly same words to encapsulate the human racial differences.[92] Pinkerton believed that "*it may be expected that as science advances, able writers will give us a complete system of the many different races of men*".[93] The main

difference between nation and race resides in fact that "*characters of nations change; characters of savage races never*".[94]

John Pinkerton emphasized that "*one sentence of Jordanes has overturned the very basis of the history of Europe*" (in the fourth chapter of Getica): "*Ex hac igitur Scandia insula, quasi officina gentium, aut certe velut vagina nationum, cum rege suo nomine Berrig Gothi quondam memorantur egressi.*"[95] Jordanes whose narrative presented abridged larger history of the Goths by Cassiodorus used Scythae, Getae, and Gothi, as synonymous words, and described the advance of this martial population from its home in Scandinavia down to Euxine, Asia, Near East and Egypt that should have been conquered about 3660 BC.[96] The above mentioned story was "blindly" repeated by Isidorus of Seville, Beda Venerabilis, Paulus Diaconus, Montesquieu, Edward Gibbon and many others.[97] This completely mistaken intellectual construction had fatal impact on understanding of European past. Pinkerton objected that Scandinavia could not have played any role in peopling the continent because it was down to late period almost uninhabited. The interior of the country was covered by enormous forests and the sea coasts alone were peopled as testified for instance by Adam of Bremen in the eleventh century.[98] It was folly to make such distant and unpopulous country a homeland of almost all European nations.[99] One can understand the patriotic rule "*Tantus amor patriae!*" However, "*false history, instead of honouring, disgraces a country. The Northern kingdoms need not such fame*".[100] Therefore, for John Pinkerton there was beyond any doubt that the Scythians (otherwise called Goths) should have migrated to Europe from Asia,[101] "*that mother of nations, wisdom, and arts*".[102]

John Pinkerton quoted Father of Church Epiphanius of Salamis (310/320−403) who had divided in his large compendium of the heresies "religious errors" into four basic periods: 1) Barbarism. 2) Scythism. 3) Hellenism or Grecian error. 4) Judaism. Scythism extended from the flood to the tower of Babel (built by Scythians themselves).[103] Pinkerton argued that Scythians had founded the oldest empire in the world history or the first

studies stand "*as much in need of a reform as the Christian religion in the time of Luther, it is not philosophy that is wanted, but common sense*" (PINKERTON, 1787, p. 81).

87) "*As we can at this day by comparing the large shape, blue eyes, and fair hair, of a German, with the small stature, small black eyes, and black hair of a Tartar*" (PINKERTON, 1787, pp. 15–16).

88) PINKERTON, 1787, pp. 17–18.

89) Ibidem, p. 18.

90) Ibidem, pp. 33–34.

91) Ibidem, p. 33.

92) "*Nevertheless, the study of dogs provides carry-over usefulness for humans in both the physical/genetic and behavioral/genetic realms*" (SARICH and MIELE, 2004, p. 186).

93) PINKERTON, 1787, p. 34.

94) PINKERTON, 1787, p. 69.

95) Cit. Ibidem, p. 23.

96) Ibidem, p. 22.

97) Ibidem, p. 23.

98) Ibidem, p. 23.

99) Ibidem, p. 172.

100) Ibidem, p. 172.

101) Ibidem, p. 24.

102) PINKERTON, 1787, p. 45. Similarly, William Camden wrote in 1610 that the Saxons were originally an Asiatic tribe (SHUGER, 1997, p. 498).

103) PINKERTON, 1787, pp. 25–26.

John Pinkerton and his vision of ancient Scythians: "Si les Aryens n'existaient pas, il faudrait les inventer" | Ivo Budil

32 | 33

of which any memory has reached us on the territory of present Persia.[104] Saturn, Jupiter, or Bacchus had been monarchs "*of this first empire, whose glorious actions procured them divine honours from their subjects after their death. This empire was perfectly barbaric, and the seat of war, not of arts*".[105] The Scythian empire seems to have expanded from Egypt to the Ganges; and from the Persian Gulf, and Indian sea, to the Caspian. Bacchus, king of Scythian state, conquered some regions in India and was deified as the god of wine by his subjects.[106] All the antiquities, the origins of government, manners, laws of English, Scottish, Irish, French, Spaniard, Italian, German, Dutch, Swiss, Swede, or Dane people and other European nations (apart from Russians, Poles, and Bohemians as descendants of Sarmatians, Celt-Welsch of England, Celt-Irish of Ireland and Highlands of Scotland, and the Fins of Hungary, Finland, and Lapland) should not be traced to the forests of Germany, as Montesquieu had supposed, but to the ancient Scythic empire in Persia.[107]

The Scythian power had been overturned by Assyrians which formed one great language or race of men including Syrian, Phoenician, Hebrew, Chaldee, Coptic, or Abyssinian and extending along the east end of the Mediterranean and Arabic seas, to the Erythrean sea, gulf of Persia, and river Euphrates.[108] John Pinkerton was convinced that modern Europeans created "*a fifth supreme empire, equal to the Scythian, Assyrian, Persian, Graecian, or Roman*".[109]

Scythians were expelled from northern Persia about 2200 BC; they crossed the river Araxes, and the vast mountains of Caucasus, which run between the Euxine and Caspian seas.[110] Later they peopled the whole northern region between the Euxine and Caspian as recorded by Herodotus.[111] These northern Scythians "*passed the Araxes to enjoy that freedom in other regions which they could not retain under the Assyrian power; for northern nations have always been fond of liberty while the southern preferred the delights and safe of their climate*".[112] John Pinkerton argued that from their settlements

on the Euxine, the Scythians (Getae, or Goths) gradually extended over most of Europe and the Greeks and Romans were Scythian origin.[113] Pinkerton emphasized that Ancient Scythia in Eastern Europe known to authors of antiquity such as Herodotus was characterized by the climatic conditions favorable to population growth: "*Poland, a country bordering on Ancient Scythia, is the most populous in Europe for it's size; and, were it not for a tyrannic government, and total depression of the people, would be twice as populous. Far the greatest part of Scandinavia lies beyond the Sixtieth degree; and is, from real, and not comparative, cold, almost desert; and all Iceland, though nearly equal to Great Britain in size* (sic), *only contains about forty thousand people; while Poland, a country little larger, has fifteen millions.*"[114] Therefore, Ancient Scythia "*was the real fountain of almost all European nations*".[115] At about 2000 BC, the Scythians should have reached the mouth of Danube. Europe at that time seemed to be almost empty continent covered by vast forest and "*thinly inhabited by a few wandering Celts, who were to the Scythae, what the savages of America are to the Europeans*",[116] or "*a negro to an European*".[117] The *Sarmatae*, the ancestors of Slavonic nations, arrived from East after Scythians.[118] Thrace, Asia Minor, Illyricum and Greece seemed to be peopled by Scythians at least 1500 BC.[119] Scythians would have arrived to Italy around 1000 BC.[120] Germany was occupied by invaders from East at least 500 BC.[121] John Pinkerton stressed that although Celts once possessed the Germany, the Germans themselves were, "*from the earliest dawn of history*", Scythians, not Celts.[122] The colonization of Europe by Scythians should have been very cruel and brutal event; the Celtic savages ("*soon finding their inferiority*") were forced to retire to the geographic extremities including Britain and Gaul.[123] Pinkerton claimed that when Caesar's legions entered Gaul to conquer it, the Celts were confined to the most remote part of Gaul within the Marne and the Loire. Caesar had to wage long and exhausting war

104) PINKERTON, 1787, p. 27.

105) PINKERTON, 1787, p. 27. "*And it might be shown that the Greek mythology is but an improvement of the Scythic; the gods being mostly illustrious princes of the first Scythic empire, who were illustrious princes of the first Scythic empire, who were deified by their subjects; a custom continued to a late period among the Goths*" (PINKERTON, 1787, p. 77).

106) PINKERTON, 1787, p. 32.

107) Ibidem, pp. 90–91.

108) Ibidem, p. 27.

109) Ibidem, pp. 3–4.

110) Ibidem, p. 34.

111) Ibidem, p. 35.

112) Ibidem, p. 37–38.

113) PINKERTON, 1787, p. 42.

114) Ibidem, p. 43.

115) Ibidem, p. 44.

116) Ibidem, p. 45.

117) Ibidem, p. 123.

118) Ibidem, p. 45.

119) Ibidem, p. 143.

120) Ibidem, p. 143.

121) Ibidem, p. 144.

122) Ibidem, p. 48.

123) PINKERTON, 1787, p. 51. "*Some remains of Celts still survive among the Alps, for the Lingua Waldensis, of which a specimen is given in Chamberlayne's Oratio Dominica, is perfect Gaelic of Ireland; a singularity which has escaped the notice of antiquaries*" (PINKERTON, 1787, p. 84).

John Pinkerton and his vision of ancient Scythians: "Si les Aryens n'existaient pas, il faudrait les inventer" | Ivo Budil

34 | 35

of annihilation against brave Gaul tribes of German or Scythian origin (Belgae, Helvetii, Allobroges, etc.) while Celts ("that bastard race") were easily defeated by a lieutenant of Caesar with one legion only.[124]

Pinkerton distinguished six basic ethnic stages of Scythian progress through the continent: 1) Thracians; 2) Illyrians; 3) Greeks; 4) Italians; 5) Germans and 6) Scandinavians. All these ethnic groups were Scythians, or Goths, in a concrete historical form of social and cultural existence.[125] The Scythians having expanded into Europe were deeply shaped by local cultural influences and natural conditions. For instance, in Greece small colonies from Egypt and Phoenicia refined by its agriculture and arts local Scythians or Goths (known as Greeks), whereas northern Scythians remained barbaric.[126]

John Pinkerton insisted that Celts, original and primitive inhabitants of Europe, constitute an inferior race. They seem to be as remote from Gothic, as the "Hottentots", or the "Laplandics":[127] *"Wisdom and ingenuity may be traced among the Samoieds, Laplanders, Negroes, etc. but among the Celts, none of native growth."*[128] Their language is in its grammar and vocabulary as distant from Gothic dialects as possible:[129] *"But the Celtic, I will venture to say, is of all savage languages the most confused, as the Celts are of all savages the most deficient in understanding."*[130] We know nothing on Celtic mythology, because the Druidic system mentioned by Gaius Iulius Caesar should have been a late invention of Phoenician origin.[131] As savage Americans or Samoiedes, Celts have never been able to build monuments.[132] Therefore, Pinkerton concluded that Celts are incapable of any progress in society.[133] He was sure that *"the Celts (were) mere radical savages, not yet advanced even to a state of barbarism; and if any foreigner doubts this, he has only to step into the Celtic part of Wales, Ireland, or Scotland, and look at them, for they are just as they were, incapable of industry or civilization, even after half their blood is Gothic, and remain, as marked by the ancients, fond of lies, and enemies of truth... Geofrey of Monmouth, most of the Irish historians, and the Highland bards, and senachies of Scotland, show that falsehood is the natural product of the Celtic mind; and the case is the same to this day. No reprobation can be too severe for these frontless impostors; and to say that a writer is a Celt, is*

124) PINKERTON, 1787, pp. 84–85.
125) Ibidem, p. 52.
126) Ibidem, pp. 76–77.
127) Ibidem, p. 67.
128) Ibidem, p. 102.
129) Ibidem, p. 67.
130) Ibidem, p. 102.
131) Ibidem, pp. 67–68.
132) Ibidem, p. 68.
133) Ibidem, p. 68.

*to say, that he is a stranger to truth, modesty, and morality.*[134]*... For they are savages, have been savages since the world began, and will be forever savages while a separate people; that is, while themselves, and of unmixt blood."*[135] It is not surprising that John Pinkerton disdained James Macpherson whose *History of Great Britain*[136] he labeled rather ironically *"strange and truly Celtic work".*[137] *"Mr. Macpherson knew that his own dear Celts are ... a weak and brutish people; and in revenge tells us we are all Sarmatae",*[138] thus Pinkerton commented alleged "clash of racial genealogies".

Pinkerton's disregard of Celts has not been exceptional in the tradition of British Isles reflecting the long and painful history of mutual animosity, hatred and violence among local ethnic groups. For instance, Sir John Davies compared in his treatise *A Discovery of the True Causes Why Ireland Was Never Entirely Subdued* (1612) inhabitants of Ireland with ancient barbarians of Germany, Gaul, or Scythia.[139] Some authors even indicate that Englishmen called Indians in the New World "barbarians" because they resembled the Irish, rather than the reverse.[140] However, there was one crucial difference between the approach of authors of Tudor/Stuart epoch and stance articulated openly by John Pinkerton. Edmund Spencer, William Camden or Sir John Davies shared the "Roman model" of colonization, which *"chased away all savage barbarism from the Britains minds... and reduced the naturall inhabitants of the Iland unto the society of civill life".*[141] They believed in a possibility of beating one's sword into a plowshare. These authors even conflated medieval culture with barbarism and were convinced that "barbaric Ireland" resembled England up to Tudor period. Therefore, *"since England grewe Civill",* the same civilizing process could transform successfully the backward and savage Ireland into prosperous civil society.[142] This optimistic vision legitimizing English imperial ambitions and conquest of Ireland was completely alien to John Pinkerton. For him nature was more important

134) PINKERTON, 1787, p. 69.
135) PINKERTON, 1787, p. 92.
136) Pinkerton rejected Macpherston's thesis expressed in this book that the Germans were originally Sarmatae.
137) PINKERTON, 1787, pp. 91–92. Pinkerton called James Macpherson "rash man, and ill advised! The mist of Celtic nonsense he may gild with the beams of real genius; but, with the ignorance of a school-boy, to write on the antiquities of the Germans, in which the learned of all Europe had been ever conversant, was deplorable indeed, and worthy of eternal laughter" (PINKERTON, 1787, p. 92).
138) PINKERTON, 1787, p. 92.
139) SHUGER, 1997, p. 495.
140) SHUGER, 1997, p. 495.
141) Cit. SHUGER, 1997, p. 496.
142) Cit. SHUGER, 1997, p. 504.

John Pinkerton and his vision of ancient Scythians: "Si les Aryens n'existaient pas, il faudrait
les inventer" | Ivo Budil

36 | 37

than nurture and he was convinced that *"characters of nations change; characters of savage races never".*[143] That is why savage Celts could not be changed. The only way how to gain control over country is either their assimilation or annihilation.

It must be reminded that the whole idea of Scythic empire in Persia was pure fantasy even in the context of the last decades of the eighteenth century. James William Johnson rightly wrote that in the Scythian society *"no central government ever evolved, the Scythian political system being a loose alliance of tribes much in the manner of the American Indian; and, like the Indian, the Scythian lived in a portable house, practiced social communism, used tomahawks and scalped his enemies".*[144] On the other hand, Pinkerton remarked that the primordial social life of ancient Scythians proved that *"democracy is the most ancient form of government".*[145] John Pinkerton commented positively "the feudal system" that would have extended from the earliest account of time through the history of Greece and Rome and the early history of the Goths and Germans who overturned the Roman empire.[146] After the eleventh century the feudal system was corrupted mostly due to the establishment of one great monarchy and hereditary aristocracy with tyranny and oppression as the by-products of this transformation.[147] Pinkerton was convinced that the genuine feudal system was purely democratic while the corrupted one was aristocratic.[148] Chivalry – *"an institution which does honour to human nature"* – should have emerged as a remedy for that corruption because its possessors were obliged to help oppressed and to oppose the tyranny:[149] *"Had the ridicule of Cervantes appeared three centuries sooner, we must have branded him as the greatest enemy of society that ever wrote. As it is, a sensible French writer* (M. Le Grand) *well observes, that it now begins to be questioned whether his book be not worthy of execration."*[150]

Therefore, Pinkerton was trying to show that to describe the origins of Western institutions one had to descend deeper into past than Montesquieu did. The roots of the English constitution could not have been found in the woods of ancient Germany,

143) PINKERTON, 1787, p. 69.
144) JOHNSON, 1959, p. 250.
145) PINKERTON, 1787, p. 136.
146) Ibidem, p. 137.
147) Ibidem, p. 127.
148) Ibidem, p. 139.
149) Ibidem, p. 138.
150) Ibidem, p. 138.

but they should be inferred from a pastoral state of society of ancient Scythians during their progress from Persia to Western Europe.[151] Deep racial history is what matters.[152]

In his studies *A Dissertation on the Origin and Progress of the Scythians or Goths and Enquiry into the History of Scotland preceeding the reign of Malcolm III* (1789) Pinkerton coined a thesis that Pictish was a Germanic (or "Gothic") language.[153] Pinkerton had stired hot controversy that lasted several decades.[154] He gained support of Jonathan Oldbuck and James Sibbal who published *Observation on the Picti, Caledonii, and Scotti* in 1802. Walter Scott who was very interested in the issue became Pinkerton's opponent,[155] because he assumed that Picts spoke *"genuine Celtic".*[156] George Chalmers criticized Pinkerton's view in his work *Caledonia* (1807–1824).[157] Joseph Ritson's posthumous *Annals of the Caledonians, Picts, and Scots* published in 1828 refuted Pinkerton's arguments and presented a death-blow to the supposed Gothic identity of Picts.[158]

After career in philology, history and Scottish poetry after 1800 John Pinkerton went off into entirely new field and turned his attention and all intellectual energy to

151) PINKERTON, 1787, p. 140.
152) *"Mr. Hume, who knew nothing about Goths, nor the Gothic constitution, and who is so shallow, that, far from reaching the bottom, he has not reached the bottom of the surface, but merely skimmed it's top, observes in his own Life, that it is ridiculous to look on the English constitution as a regular plan of liberty before the death of Charles I"* (PINKERTON, 1787, p. 142).
153) *"The English was Gothic, so was also the Pictish; the one North-Gothic, the other South-Gothic. The Picts were, indeed, as much English as the Jutes or Saxons. Nomina non mutant rem"* (PINKERTON, 1786, Ancient Scotish Poems, London, lxxi; cit. SMITH, 1951, p. 175).
154) Walter Scott later admitted that the question was *"a thorny point with every antiquity"* (cit. SMITH, 1951, p. 177).
155) In August 1801 Walter Scott wrote to George Ellis: *"The history of the Scottish language is involved in great difficultie. If we suppose with Pinkerton the Picts to have spoken a dialect of the Teutonic that no doubt would give us the ground work of lowland Scotish but not to mention other difficulties attending this opinion I think it is impossible to show that there are any Teutonick words in our dialect which may not be traced to Anglo Saxon, wheras such must unquestionably have occurred had the Scotish been founded upon the language spoken by a separate Gothic tribe"* (cit. SMITH, 1951, p. 175).
156) SMITH, 1951, p. 177.
157) Walter Scott remarked in 1829 in Quarterly Review that Chamber's studies presents *"a work unequalled, if we consider it as a mass of materials assembled by the labour of a single man"* (cit. SMITH, 1951, p. 177).
158) Walter Scott wrote rather hesitatingly in 1828: *"One set of our learned men have

John Pinkerton and his vision of ancient Scythians: "Si les Aryens n'existaient pas, il faudrait
les inventer" | Ivo Budil

38 | 39

cartography and geography.[159] Along with Malte-Brun and Jedidiah Morse he belonged among the founders of modern geography and he became an eminent member of the Edinburgh school of cartography.[160] He was even called "The English Strabo",[161] or less eulogisticly "An Armchair Geographer".[162] In 1802 when he published first edition of his main geographical work the *Modern geography*, John Pinkerton moved to Paris having benefited from the conclusion of the Peace of Amiens (along with a member of Royal Asiatic Society in Calcutta Alexander Hamilton who played an important role in spreading of knowledge of Sanskrit at the continent, especially in Germany). In February 1803, when war between France and United Kingdom was resumed, Pinkerton was allowed to stay in Paris.[163] In August 1804 John Pinkerton met Alexander von Humboldt who had just returned from his travel to South America.[164] After having returned to England he described his French experiences in book *Recollections of Paris in the years 1802, 1803, 1804 and 1805* (1806).

Despite Pinkerton's prominence in geography and cartography and significant contributions to poetry, criticism, history and antiquities Sir Walter Scott wrote after his death that Pinkerton's life "*ended in exile, in obscurity, and, we fear, in indigence*".[165] Unfortunately for John Pinkerton and his place in the history of Western science, the Scythians were eclipsed by the bright star of martial Aryans. It had to be disappointement for him

> *supported that the native speech of all the inhabitants of Scotland was of Celtic origin and that not only the Scots properly so called spoke gaeli and the south western inhabitants from the forest of Ettricke to that of Ayr comprehending an independent state called the Kingdome of Strath Clyde spoke the British or Welch Language, of which there is very little doubt, but that the nation called the Picts inhabiting the lower part of Perthshire Fife and generally speaking the country to the south east of the Grampian boundary spoke a species of Celtic also... On the other hand if the Picts were not a Celtic but a Gothick race deriving their origin from some of the German tribes it seems most probable that the present Scottish dialect has derived from their language without intervention of the Anglo-Saxon or English" (cit. SMITH, 1951, p. 178). Two years later Walter Scott concluded in Minstrelsy of the Scottish Border: "It is now generally admitted that the Scots and Picts, however differing otherwise, were each by descent a Celtic race" (cit. SMITH, 1951, p. 179).*

159) SITWELL, 1972; WILCOCK, 1974.

160) SITWELL, 1972, p. 471; WILCOCK, 1974, p. 35.

161) WILCOCK, 1974.

162) SITWELL, 1972.

163) WILCOCK, 1974, p. 40.

164) WILCOCK, 1974, p. 40.

165) Cit. WILCOCK, 1974, p. 35.

because he had an ambition to unclose to the learned of Europe "*a field of wide curiosity and enquiry*".[166] He was convinced that his "proof" that the Germans were Scythians from Asia should have started new chapter in our understanding of the emergence of West.[167]

The vision of Aryans as a new "incarnation of Scythians" was born from Indian studies. The earliest data on mutual similarities between the languages of India, Greek, and Latin came from the sixteenth century when systematic trade relations between the both civilizations had been established.[168] Father Gaston Coeurdoux wrote in 1767 in a memoir read by members of *Académie Royale des Inscriptions et Belles Lettres*: "*Japhets, eldest son of Noah, left the plain of Shinar,[169] bringing with him a third of humanity, and headed toward the West, which was his share. His seven children no doubt became the heads of as many great families, each one of which must have spoken one of the new original languages, such as Latin, Greek, Slavonic, etc. May I be permitted to add to these Sanskrit (samskroutam); it is as deserving as any other language, given its extensive reach, to be numbered among primitive languages. The supposition that I am making will perhaps later become a reality.*"[170]

The rise of British Orientalism with its base in Calcutta presented one of outcomes of the fall of Pondicherry and hegemony of British East India Company.[171] The knowledge accumulated by Jesuit missionaries and French scholars was marginalized. The development of British scholarship in India was supported by Warren Hastings, the first governor-general in Calcutta.[172] Alexander Dow, Nathaniel Brassey Halhed, John Zephaniah Holwell, Charles Wilkins and Sir William Jones,[173] Judge of the Supreme Court in Calcutta, who in 1784 initiated the establishment of the Royal Asiatic Society,[174] created

166) PINKERTON, 1787, p. 90.

167) PINKERTON, 1787, p. 109.

168) Jesuit Thomas Stephens wrote in Goa on October 24, 1583, in a letter to his brother Richard: "Linguae harum regionum sunt permultae. Pronuntiationem habent non invenustam, et compositionem latinae graecaeque similem; phrases et constructiones plane mirabiles, Literae syllabarum vim habent, quae toties variantur, quoties consonantes vocalibus, vel mutae cum liquidis combinari possunt" (cit. OLENDER, 1994, p. 20). Fr. Raphelengius mentioned in his letter of May 18, 1584, to Justus Lipsius some examples of similarities between German and Persian languages (OLENDER, 1994, p. 20).

169) The valley where the confusion of Babel takes place in Genesis (11.2) (OLENDER, 1994, p. 20).

170) Cit. OLENDER, 1994, p. 20.

171) BUDIL, 2007.

172) BUDIL, 2007, p. 79.

173) ALUN, 1996; GODFREY, 1967; MASTER, 1946; ROCHER, 1980.

174) STEADMAN, 1977.

John Pinkerton and his vision of ancient Scythians: "Si les Aryens n'existaient pas, il faudrait
les inventer" | Ivo Budil

40 | 41

the most influential orientalist community at the end of the eighteenth century whose impulses and discoveries complied to the sensitivity of Western romanticism.[175] In February 1786 William Jones designated in his "presidential speech" Sanskrit, Greek, Latin, Gothic, Celt dialects and ancient Persian as homological and genetically related languages, which were of common descent: *"The Sanskrit language, whatever may be its antiquity, is of wonderful structure; more perfect than the Greek, more copious than the Latin, and more exquisitely refined than either, yet bearing to both of them a strong affinity, both in the roots of verbs and in the forms of grammar, than could possibly have been produced by accident; so strong indeed that no philologer could examine them all three, without believing them to have sprung from some common source, which, perhaps no longer exists; there is a similar reason, though not quite so forcible, for supposing that both the Gothic and the Celtic, though blended with a very different idiom, had the same origin with the Sanskrit; and the old Persian might be added to the same family, if this were the place for discussing any questions concerning the antiquities of Persia."*[176] In Calcutta erudite scholarship and romantic ideology created a successful alliance called later "oriental renaissance" by Edgar Quinet.[177] Ferdinand de Saussure wrote in 1878: *"There is certainly, at the root of research on the Aryans, in description of this people of the golden age, revised and embellished by the imagination, the almost conscious dream of an ideal humanity."*[178] In this sense, Aryans became inheritors of Scythians in the development of Western imagination and its nostalgic leaning. The relatively smooth transition from the Scythian hypothesis into Aryan paradigm was reflected in Volney's contribution *Discours sur l'étude philosophique des languages* read in December 1819 at the *Académie Française*. Volney apparently mistook Scythian language for Sanscrit: *"For one hundred years, the language of this Scythian nation, discovered by our European scholars in the sacred books of India under the name of Sanscrit, is more and more recognized to be the basis, not only of an infinity of words, but of the grammatical systems of a multitude of ancient and modern languages."*[179] The scholars such as Friedrich Schlegel, Franz Bopp or Friedrich Max Müller transformed Jones romantic heritage into modern historical linguistics.[180]

John Pinkerton was not aware of the progresses made by the British in the Royal Asiatic Society in Calcutta and therefore he did not comment on Sanskrit or translations from Indian literature at all. He did quote the name of Sir William Jones only once in a short critical footnote: *"See Richardson's Dissertation prefixed to his Persian and Arabic*

175) BUDIL, 2002, pp. 93–103.
176) Cit. BUDIL, 2007, p. 79.
177) BUDIL, 2009.
178) Cit. OLENDER, 1994, p. 24.
179) Cit. OLENDER, 1994, p. 21.
180) BUDIL, 2002, pp. 171–173.

*Dictionary, who however, as well as the most learned Jones, forgets the similarity of the Persian and Gothic."*[181] Pinkerton was aware of resemblance in grammar and vocabulary between German and Persian noticed already by Scaliger or Boxhorn,[182] but it was in accordance with his own thesis on the arrival of Scythian (or Gothic) tribes into Europe from that region.

Pinkerton's transformation of traditional Scytho-Celtic paradigm into racial interpretation of European history including the elimination or marginalization of autochthonous "inferior" race by martial and vital nomadic populations of Germanic origin coming from their Asian homeland constituted an important innovation anticipating the basic structure of Aryan ideology. So, we could conclude with a paraphrase of Voltaire: *„Si les Aryens n'existaient pas, il faudrait les inventer."*

## Literature

ALUN, David (1996): Sir William Jones, Biblical Orientalism and Indian Scholarship. Modern Asian Studies 30 (1): 173–184

BUDIL, Ivo (2002): Od prvotního jazyka k rase. Praha: Academia.

BUDIL, Ivo (2007): Abraham Hyacinthe Anquetil Duperron: Clash of Orientalists in the Eighteenth Century India. Prague Papers on the History of International Relations 2007: 63–81.

BUDIL, Ivo (2009): The Phenomenon of the Oriental Renaissance in the Context of French Romanticism: Interpretation by Edgar Quinet. In: Vlčková Maříková, Petra, Mynářová Jana a Martin Tomášek, eds., My Things Changed Things, Social Development and Cultural Exchange in Prehistory, Antiquity, and the Middle Ages, pp. 74–77. Praha: Univerzita Karlova v Praze.

CRAIGIE, W. A. (1927): Macpherson on Pinkerton: Literary Amenities of the Eighteenth Century. Modern Language Association 42 (2): 433–442.

GODFREY, John J. (1967): Sir William Jones and Père Coeurdoux: A Philological Footnote. Journal of the American Oriental Society 87 (1): 57–59.

HORSMAN, Reginald (1976): Origins of Racial Anglo-Saxonism in Great Britain 1850. Journal of the History of Ideas 37 (3): 387–410.

JOHNSON, James William (1959): The Scythian: His Rise and Fall. Journal of the History of Ideas 20(2):250–257.

KIDD, Colin (1999): British Identities Before Nationalism: Ethnicity and Nationhood in the Atlantic World 1600–1800. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

MALLET, Paul-Henri (1758): L'Introduction à l'histoire du Dannemarc où l'on traite de la religion des moeurs, des lois, et des usages des anciens Danois. Copenhague: C. a A. Philihert.

MALLET, Paul-Henri (1847): Northern Antiquities. London: George Woodfall.

MASTER, Alfred (1946): The Influence of Sir William Jones upon Sanskrit Studies. Bulletin of the School of Oriental and African Studies 11 (4): 686–694.

OLENDER, Maurice (1994): Europe, or How to Escape Babel. History and Theory 33 (4): 5–25.

PERCY, Thomas (1910): Reliques of Ancient English Poetry. London: J.M. Dent; New York: E.P. Dutton.

181) PINKERTON, 1787, p. 38.
182) PINKERTON, 1787, p. 112.

PINKERTON, John (1787): A Dissertation on the Origin and Progress of the Scythians or Goths. London: John Nichols.

POLIAKOV, Léon (1996): The Aryan Myth. A History of Racist and Nationalist Ideas in Europe. New York: Barnes & Noble.

ROCHER, Rosane (1980): Lord Monboddo, Sanskrit and Comparative Linguistics. Journal of the American Oriental Society 100 (1): 12–17.

RUBIÉS, Joan-Pau (1991): Hugo Grotius's Dissertation on the Origin of the American Peoples and the Use of Comparative Methods. Journal of the History of Ideas 52 (2): 221–244.

SARICH, Vincent and Frank MIELE (2004): Race: The Reality of Human Differences. Boulder: Westview Press.

SHUGER, Debora (1997): Irishmen, Aristocrats, and Other White Barbarians. Renaissance Quarterly 50 (2): 494–525.

SITWELL, O. F. G. (1972): John Pinkerton: An Armchair Geographer of the Early Nineteenth Century. The Geographical Journal 138 (4): 470–479.

SMITH, Roland M. (1951): Sir Walter Scott and the Pictish Question. Modern Language Notes 66 (2): 175–180.

STEADMAN, J. M. (1977): The Asiatick Society of Bengal. Eighteenth-Century Studies 10 (4): 464–483.

WILCOCK, A. A. (1974): "The English Strabo": The Geographical Publications of John Pinkerton. Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers 61 (March): 35–45.

http://www.fordham.edu/halsall/source/liudprand1.html, 447–448, 2. 1. 2009.

# Dominika Kovářová

# Gestika a její podoby ve výuce cizího jazyka

*Abstract:*

*La communication non verbale est considérée comme une discipline de transition dont la base non seulement provient de différentes sciences, mais évolue encore et constamment d'un commun accord avec elles. Dans le cadre de la gestuelle on distingue emblèmes, illustrateurs, régulateurs, gestes émotionnels et adapteurs. Afin de pouvoir étudier et analyser des gestes et la gestuelle des hommes, il est indispensable de trouver un moyen stable pour définir les règles de leur transcription. Il faut dire que pour l'instant il n'y a pas de transcription unifiée et codifiée, chaque chercheur développant alors sa propre transcription qui correspond le mieux à ses besoins. Les théories étant variées, nous présentons les concepts de deux chercheurs francophones moins connus (Guiraud, Turchet). La gestuelle devient très importante vis-à-vis le processus éducatif, notamment l'enseignement des langues étrangères. Son rôle et son apport à la didactique des langues étrangères ne sont pas encore suffisamment analysés, mais il est évident que son application dirigée et consciente puisse animer les cours et motiver les étudiants à mieux gérer leur langage du corps – donc à devenir plus persuasifs et plus assertifs tout en développant leurs compétences professionnelles, indispensables de nos jours pour la réussite dans le monde, notamment celui des affaires.*